

## **Review of Articles**

Lei Wang

Syracuse University

May 29, 2020

Submitted to:

Yuan Dickerson, Ph.D.

Course Instructor

EDU603— Introduction to Qualitative Research

### **Author Note**

This review of articles was submitted to Dr. Yuan Dickerson, Ph.D., on May 29, 2020, as part of the EDU 603 Introduction to Qualitative Research coursework.

- **Title of article full referenced in APA**

Militello, M., Ringler, M. C., Hodgkins, L., & Hester, D. M. (2017). I am, I am becoming: How community engagement changed our learning, teaching, and leadership. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education: Special Issue: Ecologies of Engaged Scholarship: Stories from Activist Academics*, 30(1), 58-73. doi:10.1080/09518398.2016.1242812

- **Research purpose / questions**

This article explored the development of community-engaged scholars and practitioners through two distinct lenses: faculty who facilitate engaged learning processes and student-practitioners who are enacting these processes in their work.

- **Theoretical (Conceptual) framework**

This article used Homan's theory of sentiment, activity, and interaction. Homans' studies were focused on three elements of the workers: Activity (what people do); Interaction (relationships to one another), and Sentiment (internal feeling). Homans found interdependency in this triumvirate. Actions and relationships matter most when it comes to one's sentiment. In turn, sentiment has the greatest impact on work (both efficiency and quality). Each of our individual stories has elements of activity, interaction, and sentiment. Each of us had mentors that created space for deep, meaningful conversation rooted in questions rather than answers, in practice rather than telling.

- **Data collection methods and sampling procedures**

Biographies and autobiographies. The authors used an auto-ethnographic technique, their own stories, to examine the will (motivation) and capacity (knowledge) gained through community engagement. More importantly, they provided vivid accounts of marked differences in our teaching, learning, and leadership. The authors drew a purposive sample, a researcher begins with specific perspectives in mind that he or she wishes to examine themselves. Every interview or observation has narrative aspect, the authors sorted out and made reflections on them, enhanced them, and presented them in a revised shape.

- **Data analysis methods**

Narrative methodologies analysis. Narratives were employed as a methodology and the authors' own experience or their students' experiences were the unit of analysis. The core activities in this study were to reformulate the stories presented by the four professors and their students in different but similar contexts and based on their different experiences.

- **Findings/Conclusions**

The authors created a logic model for community engagement for the activist scholar at community engagement with the triumvirate of *know-why* (the philosophical premise of why this work is valuable), *know-how* (the procedural elements of how the work is done), and *doing* (the implementation of this work with fidelity and measures). The proved courage, challenge, and provocation – important lessons teachers can pass along to their students.

- **Personal reactions/Critique**

I am intrigued by this article, which is well laid out and I felt authentic when reviewing this article. The conclusion the authors drew from accounts can be represented as a narrative story to understand the phenomenon. The researchers were focused on the research purpose and related the conclusions of the study back to the original research purpose, and illustrate the benefits to global and formal teaching and learning, a new normative practice, and an accommodation of knowledge for the next generation of educators.

- **Title of article full referenced in APA**

Schiera, A. J. (2019). Justice, practice and the 'real world': Pre-service teachers' critically conscious visions for teaching amid the complexities and challenges of learning to teach. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 32(7), 929-946. doi:10.1080/09518398.2019.1609125

- **Research purpose / questions**

This article aimed to investigate the relationship between pre-service teachers learning critical conceptual tools about justice and equity, and the 'problem of enactment' of leveraging that learning in their practice in the author's social justice-oriented foundations course.

Three research questions are listed as follows:

1. What is the relationship between how pre-service teachers conceptualize their teaching practice and their beliefs and understandings about justice and equity?
2. How do they try to enact those conceptualizations in the context of their student teaching placements?
3. What, if any, tensions arise as they negotiate the relationship of justice/equity and their enacted teaching practice in their student teaching placement context?

- **Theoretical (Conceptual) framework**

This article drew on a theoretical framework linking Social Justice Teacher Education (SJTE) and Practice-based teacher education (PBTE).

- **Data collection methods and sampling procedures**

Practitioner research methodologies and critical qualitative research methods. Data sources included pre-service teachers' work in my foundations course, three semi-structured interviews before and during their student teaching practica, artifacts of their student teaching practice (videos, lesson plans, student work, etc.), their final teacher research inquiry portfolio, and one final focus group. The social identities of seven pre-service teachers purposefully were selected pre-service teachers in this study. All were enrolled in an urban-focused pre-service teacher preparation program with a long-standing focus on social justice and practitioner inquiry and an emerging focus on employing practice-based methods.

- **Data analysis methods**

Content analysis. The author conducted multiple read-throughs of the entire data corpus and then engaged in a first round of open coding, including some in vivo codes. Following a series of analytic memos, the author created pattern codes, including 'goals/purposes,' 'approach to instruction,' 'patterns of enactment,' and 'tensions' (Emerson et al., 2011).

- **Findings/Conclusions**

Lesson from the discussions and new avenues were suggested at this convergence between justice and practice, SJTE and PBTE, and critical and sociocultural frameworks.

- **Personal reactions/Critique**

I appreciate the author's writing format, clear and easy to follow. The article starts with an abstract which immediately introduces the reader to the purpose of the research, the theoretical framework, the methodologies the study employed, and the inductive findings. The study also provides clear statements about the chosen research approach, and the author used the qualitative approach to obtain thick description of the students' perceptions of preparation or transformation from the social justice-oriented foundations course to the real world.

- **Title of article full referenced in APA**

Zou, Y. (2002). Multiple identities of a Chinese immigrant: A story of adaptation and empowerment. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 15(3), 251-268. doi:10.1080/09518390210122854

- **Research purpose / questions**

To propose the notion that new multiple identities are indeed a significant new cultural capital permitting immigrants to function effectively in new and challenging cultural worlds.

- **Theoretical (Conceptual) framework**

This article described the nature of race and racism in the politics of identity formation, but no framework can be found.

- **Data collection methods and sampling procedures**

Personal narratives (autobiography). The author reflected and described her life chronicle in China and America, especially the important events in the past. She described her new identity in the United States. She documented how she conducted an ethnographic research project on the Miao in Beijing and Guizhou of China. She first prepared a set of questions ranging from their personal backgrounds to the opinions about government policies towards minorities. The author did participant observation and in-depth interviews with Miao university professors and some students. The professors and students were inspired by the author's idea of long-term views of economic and industrial plans to move upward the entire Miao group around, they followed the questions and developed new ideas.

- **Data analysis methods**

Narrative analysis. The author told us stories and used documents and self-memos to help organize and make sense of her life.

- **Findings/Conclusions**

The author used personal thoughts in the findings. She mentioned the possession of several identities for an immigrant person is not just a way to adapt and survive but becomes an asset, a new cultural capital that enhances the capacity to succeed in our modern global society. Regarding the debate on the Asian-American "model minorities," she expressed her feeling: "achievement for us Asian-Americans, as immigrants, and for our children has been far from easy. It has not been a rapidly ascending line to success. On the contrary, we have failed many times but continued to fight. We have had to face our lack of knowledge and experience, but we continue to try because we are building the empowerment of the next generation. Our children struggle, and we encourage them to continue to try and make more serious efforts. It has not been easy!" She thought the cultural therapy as a healing process was the realization that there has to be an acceptance of the self based on a profound historical and cultural knowledge of one's own family.

- **Personal reactions/Critique**

As a reader, I can probe that the author chose the storied accounts are functional and purposeful. I am impressed by the introduction, which contextualizes the research by introducing the reader to the notions including multiple personal and collective identities. This provided the background for me to sense cultural change and its relationship to a global context. She focused more on the narrative content. All the stories were composed to redefine her multiple identities and demonstrate how she adapted to the American society and became the new cultural capital. The trail of the process is clear, and her personal thoughts are very interesting, particularly to Chinese readers.